Philosophy Capstone: Debates about Animals - Spring 2010

About the Capstone in Philosophy

The Capstone in Philosophy is designed to bring together several different areas of Philosophy around a theme. This year's theme is Debates about Animals. The readings range across philosophy of mind, ethical theory, political philosophy, philosophy of biology, applied ethics, feminist philosophy, continental philosophy and literary representations of philosophical arguments. Hopefully, there's something here for everyone!

This is not a lecture class, but a text and discussion class. You should have done the reading before each class. You need to show up with the text, to refer to it in class, and to have made notes on the text. Everyone is expected to come to class each week with at least one question for discussion on the texts; I will be asking people at random each week what their question is. 5% of the overall grade for the class will rest on participation – both in terms of having questions prepared and contributing helpfully to class discussion.

Everyone will also be expected to make two presentations in the course of the semester. Your presentation should be about 20 minutes long. You may make your presentation to the class in any form you like, but you must hand in at the end of the class in which you present a paper that I will read and grade on the material you have been presenting. Each of your presentation papers is worth 20% of your overall grade. You need to sign up for a presentation in the first class.

Your presentation should include

(a) Background, where relevant, on the texts you are discussing. Some of the readings, for instance are book chapters from longer texts – you might need to look at the whole text in order to explain some of the material from it. You might also want to say something about the author, locate the text in a relevant debate, relate to materials we have already covered on the course etc.
(b) Give a detailed and accurate summary of the text(s), picking out the key points you think the author(s) is/are making.
(c) Point out weaknesses, flaws in the argument, problems or criticisms you have with respect to the reading(s)
(d) Outline a series of questions for discussion, explaining why you think these are important and relevant questions for us to consider.

Other assessment

The remaining 55% of the course will be assessed on a final paper due in on Thursday May 3rd. This paper should be a minimum of 10 and a maximum of 12 pages long, 1 inch margins, 12-point font. You will be able to choose your topic from any of the different issues we have covered on the course. Whatever topic you choose, the paper must argue for a thesis. Prior to selecting a topic and a title you must talk to me in person or by e-mail so that I can approve the topic.
**Week 1: Introductory**

**Tuesday Jan 19th:** Introductions, course overview, presentation sign ups

**Thursday Jan 21st: What Animals Are**

2. Mary Midgley “Beasts, Brutes and Monsters” in Ingold, Tim *What is an animal?* Unwin Hyman 1988 pp.35-46 (Telesis)
3. Michel Foucault “Preface” to *The Order of Things* – just xv to midway down xvi, (1.5 pages) – (Telesis) **(PRESENTATION 1)**

**SECTION ONE: ANIMAL MINDS**

**Week 2: Animal Minds (1) Animal Pain**

**Tuesday 26th January: Descartes and the “Modern Cartesians”**

3. Harrison, Peter “Do Animals Feel Pain?” *Philosophy* 53 1978 551-559 (Telesis) **(PRESENTATION 2)**

**Thursday 28th January: Animals and Phenomenal Pain**


**Week 3 Animal Minds (2) Animal Cognition**

**Tuesday 2nd Feb: Animal – and Ape- Cognitive Abilities**

2. Daniel Povinelli “Behind the Ape’s Appearance” *Daedalus* 133 2004 29-41 (Telesis) **(PRESENTATION 4)**

**Thursday 4th Feb**

Visiting Prof: Prof Jose Bermudez


**NO PRESENTATION: BUT YOU MUST EACH COME WITH A QUESTIONS PREPARED TO ASK THE AUTHOR**

**SECTION TWO: ANIMALS IN ETHICAL/POLITICAL THEORY**

**Week 4: Animals and contract theory**

**Tuesday 9th Feb: Animals and Ethical Contractarianism**


(PRESENTATION 5)

**Thursday 11th Feb: The Domesticated Animal Contract?**
Chapter 1 pp.1-17 “Visions of Nature” from Stephen Budiansky *The Covenant of the Wild* (Telesis)

(PRESENTATION 6)

**Week 5: Animals and Rights Theory**

**Tuesday 16th Feb: The Animal Rights Debate**
Carl Cohen “Response to Regan” (Telesis)
(Both from the *Animal Ethics Reader*, 1st Edition ed. Armstrong and Botzler)

(PRESENTATION 7)

**Thursday 18th Feb: Other Worries about Animal Rights**
Jamieson, Dale “Rights, Justice and Duties to Provide Assistance: A Critique of Regan’s Theory of Rights” *Ethics* 100/2 349-362

(PRESENTATION 8)

**Week 6: Animals and Utilitarianism**

**Tuesday 23rd Feb: Singer’s Utilitarianism**
(1) Peter Singer “Equality for Animals” at [http://www.utilitarian.net/singer/by/1979----.html](http://www.utilitarian.net/singer/by/1979----.html)

(PRESENTATION 9)

**Thursday Feb 25th Feb: What Utilitarianism Entails**
(1) Gary Francione “Animal Rights Theory and Utilitarianism: Relative Normative Guidance” in *Between the Species* 2003 at [http://cla.calpoly.edu/bts/issue_03/03francione.htm](http://cla.calpoly.edu/bts/issue_03/03francione.htm)
(2) Hugh LaFollette and Niall Shanks “Utilizing Animals” *Journal of Applied Philosophy* 12/1 1995 pp. 13-25 (Telesis)

(PRESENTATION 10)

**Week 7: Animals and Capabilities Approaches**

**Tuesday 2nd March: Nussbaum’s Account**

(PRESENTATION 11)

**Thursday 4th March: Some Responses to Nussbaum**
(2) Peter Singer “A Response to Martha Nussbaum” at http://www.utilitarian.net/singer/by/20021113.htm
(PRESENTATION 12)

Week 8: Mid-Semester Break

SECTION 3: FOUR BIG ISSUES

Week 9: Killing Animals

Tuesday 16th March: McMahan on Killing
(PRESENTATION 13)

Thursday 18th March: Killing Animals – What Rights Permit
Evelyn Pluhar “When is it Morally Acceptable to Kill Animals?” Journal of Agricultural Ethics vol. 2 1988 211-224 (Telesis)
(PRESENTATION 14)

Week 10: Eating Animals

Tuesday 23rd March: Utilitarianism, Rights and Vegetarianism
(1) Tom Regan “Utilitarianism, Vegetarianism and Animal Rights” Philosophy and Public Affairs 9 pp 305-324 (Telesis)
(2) Peter Singer “Utilitarianism and Vegetarianism” Philosophy and Public Affairs 9 325-327 (Telesis)
(PRESENTATION 15)

Thursday 25th March: Thinking Through Vegetarianism
(2) Alistair Norcross “Puppies, Pigs and People: Eating Meat and Marginal Cases” Philosophical Perspectives 18 2004 (Telesis)
(PRESENTATION 16)

Week 11: Animals, Property, Environment

Tuesday 30th March: Property Rights and Conflict in Africa
(1)Ian Whyte “Headaches and Heartaches: The Elephant Management Dilemma” (pp.293-305)
(PRESENTATION 17)

Thursday 1st April: Animals as Property Owners
Week 12 Animal Species

Tuesday 7th April: Should we protect animal species?
(1) Holmes Rolston “Duties to Endangered Species” *Bioscience* 35/11 1988 718-726 (Telesis)
(2) “On the Moral Considerability of Homo Sapiens and other species” Ron Sandler and Judith Crane *Environmental Values* 15 2006 69-84. (Telesis)
(PRESENTATION 19)

Thursday 9th April: Species’ “Integrity” & Genetic Manipulation
(1) Bernie Rollin “On Telos and Genetic Engineering” pp.156-171
(2) Alan Holland “Species are dead! Long live Genes!” pp.225-240
(PRESENTATION 20)

SECTION 4: THREE ALTERNATIVE APPROACHES

Week 13: Feminist Philosophy and Animals

Tuesday 13th April: Plumwood
Val Plumwood “Dualism: the logic of colonialism” Ch.2 of *Feminism and the Mastery of Nature* (London: Routledge 1993) pp.41-68. (Telesis)
(PRESENTATION 21)

Thursday 15th April: Feminist Ethics and Animals
Donovan, Josephine “Animal Rights and Feminist Theory” *Signs* 15 350-375 (Telesis)
Noddings, Nel “Comment on Donovan’s Animal Rights and Feminist Theory” *Signs* 16 418-422 (Telesis)
(PRESENTATION 22)

Week 14: Continental Philosophy and Animals: Two Approaches

Tuesday 20th April: Derrida
(PRESENTATION 23)

Thursday 22nd April: Foucault
(1)Michel Foucault: Extracts from *Madness and Civilization* pp.65-71
(2) Clare Palmer: Madness and Animality in Michel Foucault’s Madness and Civilization pp.72-84 (both on Telesis)
(PRESENTATION 24)
Week 15: Literary Representation of Philosophical Arguments: *The Lives of Animals*, J.M Coetzee

Tuesday 27th & 29th April:
Coetzee's *The Lives of Animals* Princeton University Press paperback 2001. You must get the edition edited by Amy Gutmann. We will discuss the text on 27th April *(PRESENTATION 25)* and the accompanying essays by Gutmann, Doniger, Smuts and Singer on 29th April. *(PRESENTATION 26)* You will need to acquire your own copy of this book. Amazon is selling many second-hand copies for $5.00. There is only one copy in the library.